Computational partial algebras and structural clones

Peter Jipsen

School of Computational Sciences and Center of Excellence in Computation, Algebra and Topology (CECAT) Chapman University, Orange, California

Algebras and Algorithms 2016

University of Colorado at Boulder

Outline

- Partial algebras
- Partial clones
- Computing all partial clones generated by *n*-ary operations
- Natural duality for partial algebras
- Structural clones
- Computing all structural clones on {0,1} generated by binary operations
- ISP(a 2-element partial algebra)

First part mostly based on The lattice of alter egos







and Ross Willard

Abstract

We describe an algorithm for calculating finitely generated structural clones, defined by [Davey Pitkethly Willard: The lattice of alter egos, IJAC 22, 2012] as partial clones that are closed under equalizers and restriction to domain.

The algorithm has been implemented in Python and JavaScript and is used to calculate all 1693 structural clones on a two-element set generated by a set of partial binary operations (excluding the trivial operation with empty domain).

These results are related to the dualizability of partial algebras since if two partial algebras generate the same structural clone then the partial algebras are either both dualizable or both non-dualizable.

Partial algebras

A partial *n*-ary operation on *A* is a map $f : D_f \to A$ where $D_f \subseteq A^n \langle A, F \rangle$ is a partial algebra if *F* is a set of partial operations

If $A = \{a_1, ..., a_n\}$, then a partial algebra can be defined by a list of **partially filled out** operation tables

	f	g	a_1	•••	a _n	_	h	a ₁	•••	a _n		a ₁		a _n
a_1	b_1	a_1	<i>c</i> ₁	•••	—		a_1	e_1	•••	—		—	•••	l _n
:	÷	÷	÷		÷		÷	÷		÷	÷	÷		÷
a _n	-	an	-		dn		an	en	• • •	_		k _n		-

Convention: every **(total)** algebra is a partial algebra Also, every relational structure is a partial algebra E.g. a relation $R \subseteq A^n$ is given by a restricted projection $p_R : D_{p_R} \to A$

$$p_R(x_1,\ldots,x_n) = \begin{cases} x_n & \text{if } R(x_1,\ldots,x_n) \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

The category of partial algebras of fixed type

The type of a partial algebra is a set \mathscr{F} of (partial) function symbols, each with an associated finite arity

 $h: \mathbf{A} \to \mathbf{B}$ is a **homomorphism** if $h(f^{\mathbf{A}}(x_1, \dots, x_n)) = f^{\mathbf{B}}(h(x_1), \dots, h(x_n))$ for all $(x_1, \dots, x_n) \in D_{f^{\mathbf{A}}}$ and all $f \in \mathscr{F}$

Note: $h(p_R^{\mathbf{A}}(x_1,...,x_n)) = p_R^{\mathbf{B}}(h(x_1),...,h(x_n))$

iff
$$R^{\mathbf{A}}(x_1,\ldots,x_n) \Longrightarrow R^{\mathbf{B}}(h(x_1),\ldots,h(x_n))$$

so homomorphisms agree for relational structures and their corresponding partial algebras

The *i*th *n*-ary projection is $p_{i,n}(x_1,...,x_n) = x_i$ (a total operation)

 Π is the set of all projections of finite arity

Partial clones

Let f be n-ary and g_1, \ldots, g_n m-ary partial operations

The **composition** $f \circ [g_1, \ldots, g_n]$ is the *m*-ary partial operation *h* defined by

$$h(x_1,\ldots,x_m)=f(g_1(x_1,\ldots,x_m),\ldots,g_n(x_1,\ldots,x_m))$$

 \mathscr{P}_A is the **set of all partial operations** on A

A **partial clone** is a subset of \mathscr{P}_A that contains all projections and is closed under composition

PClo(F) is the **partial clone generated** by a set F of partial functions

= the smallest set that contains $F \cup \Pi$ and is closed under composition

 $PClo_n(F) = \{ \text{the } n \text{-ary partial operations in } PClo(F) \}$

 $Clo(F) = \{ total operations in PClo(F) \}$ Peter Jipsen — Chapman University — May 19, 2016

The lattice of partial clones

 $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{P}_A)$ is the algebraic lattice of partial clones on a finite set A

 $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{T}_A)$ is the algebraic lattice of total clones on A (\mathscr{T}_A = all total ops)

 $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{T}_A)$ is a complete sublattice of $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{P}_A)$ since any composition of total operations is total

Every partial algebra can be extended to a total algebra $\tilde{\mathbf{A}}$ by adding one element $\infty \notin A$

 $\tilde{f}(x_1, \dots, x_n) = \begin{cases} f(x_1, \dots, x_n) & \text{if } f(x_1, \dots, x_n) \text{is defined (i.e., exists)} \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ Therefore $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{P}_A)$ is embedded in $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{T}_{A \cup \{\infty\}})$

Post lattice of all total clones on $\{0,1\}$



 $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{T}_{\{0,1\}})$ is countable (picture from Schölzel 2010)

 $\mathbb{L}(\mathscr{P}_{\{0,1\}})$ is uncountable (true even for strong partial clones = partial clones closed under restriction to any subset of the domain)

Computing partial clones

 $\mathbb{L}_n(\mathscr{P}_A) =$ lattice of partial clones generated by *n*-ary partial operations

There are $(|A|+1)^{|A|^n}$ *n*-ary partial operations

hence $|\mathbb{L}_n(\mathscr{P}_A)| < 2^{(|A|+1)^{|A|^n}}$

E. g.
$$|\mathbb{L}_1(\mathscr{P}_{\{0,1\}})| < 2^{3^{2^1}} = 2^9 = 512$$
 and $|\mathbb{L}_2(\mathscr{P}_{\{0,1\}})| < 2^{3^{2^2}} = 2^{81} \approx 10^{24}$

 $Clo_n(F) = Free_{\langle A, F \rangle}(n)$, and the same result holds for finite partial algebras

So can use Birkhoff's subpower algorithm to calculate $\mathsf{PClo}_n(\mathbf{A})$ as a subalgebra of $(A\cup\{\infty\})^{|A^n|}$

Most efficient implementation is in UACalc

An algorithm for computing $\mathbb{L}_n(\mathscr{P}_A)$

- 1. Let $\mathscr{C} = \{ \mathsf{PClo}_n(\{f\}) : f \in \mathscr{P}_A \text{ with arity } n \}$
- 2. Let ${\mathscr D}$ and ${\mathscr L}$ be copies of ${\mathscr C}$

Repeat

3. Let
$$\mathscr{E} = \{ \mathsf{PClo}_n(F \cup G) : F \in \mathscr{C} \text{ and } G \in \mathscr{D} \}$$

4. Let $\mathscr{D} = \mathscr{E} \setminus \mathscr{D}$
5. Let $\mathscr{L} = \mathscr{L} \cup \mathscr{D}$

Until $\mathscr{D} = \emptyset$

6. \mathscr{L} contains all *n*-ary partial clones, each one determined by a generating set of minimal size

A Galois connection for partial operations

[DPW12] Davey, Pitkethly and Willard: *The lattice of alter egos, Intl. J. of Algebra and Comp.*, 2012

For a matrix $[a_{ij}] \in A^{m \times n}$ denote the rows by a_{i*} and the columns by a_{*j}

Let f, g be partial operations on A with arity m, n respectively and define

 $f \sim g$ iff for all $[a_{ij}] \in A^{m imes n}$ $(a_{i*} \in D_g \text{ and } a_{*j} \in D_f \text{ for all } i \leq m, j \leq n$

$$\implies \exists b \in A \text{ s.t. } f(g(a_{1*}), \ldots, g(a_{m*})) = b = g(f(a_{*1}), \ldots, f(a_{*n})))$$

Characterizing the Galois closed sets

Note: $f \sim p_R$ is equivalent to the standard notion f preserves R

For
$$F \subseteq \mathscr{P}_A$$
 let $F^{\Diamond} = \{g \in \mathscr{P}_A : f \sim g \text{ for all } f \in F\}$

A conjunct-atomic formula is of the form $\psi_1(\mathbf{v}) \& \cdots \& \psi_n(\mathbf{v})$ with ψ_i atomic

A *k*-ary relation *R* is **conjunct-atomic definable** if $R = \{ \mathbf{a} \in A^k : \psi_1(\mathbf{a}) \& \cdots \& \psi_n(\mathbf{a}) \}$ for some atomic formulas ψ_i

 $Def_{Ca}(F) = \{conjunct-atomic relations definable from F\}$

Theorem [DPW12]: (i) $g \in F^{\Diamond \Diamond}$ if and only if

 $D_g \in \text{Def}_{Ca}(F)$ and $g = f \upharpoonright E$ for some $f \in \text{PClo}(F)$ and $E \subseteq A$ (ii) $F = F^{\Diamond \Diamond}$ if and only if F is a partial clone on A closed under restriction of domain to relations in $\text{Def}_{Ca}(F)$

Structural clones

The Galois closed sets of the closure operator $^{\Diamond\Diamond}$ are called **structural clones**

Notation: $SClo(F) = F^{\Diamond\Diamond}$ and $SClo_n(F) = n$ -ary members

The lattice of structural clones is denoted $\mathbb{S}(\mathcal{P}_A)$

Since \sim is a symmetric relation, $\mathbb{S}(\mathscr{P}_A)$ is a self-dual algebraic lattice

Partial algebras A_1, A_2 on the same set A are structurally equivalent if $SClo(A_1) = SClo(A_2)$

For algebras, this agrees with clone equivalence

Natural duality (briefly)

- Duality theory aims to find categorical (dual) equivalences between two categories
- **Natural dualities** provide a framework using homomorphisms into a generating object
- E.g. **Stone duality** $D : BA \rightarrow Stone$, $E : Stone \rightarrow BA$ given by

 $D(\mathbf{A}) = \text{Hom}(\mathbf{A}, \mathbf{2})$ with product topology from $\underline{\mathbf{2}}^A$, $D(h)(x) = x \circ h$ $E(\mathbf{X}) = \text{Hom}(\mathbf{X}, \underline{\mathbf{2}})$ with operations inherited from $\mathbf{2}^X$, $E(k)(a) = a \circ k$

• Or **Priestley duality** $D : BDL \rightarrow Pri, E : Pri \rightarrow BDL$ given by

 $D(\mathbf{A}) = \text{Hom}(\mathbf{A}, \mathbf{C}_2)$ with product topology from $\underline{\mathbf{C}}_2^A$, $D(h)(x) = x \circ h$ $E(\mathbf{X}) = \text{Hom}(\mathbf{X}, \underline{\mathbf{C}}_2)$ with operations inherited from \mathbf{C}_2^X , $E(k)(a) = a \circ k$

 Then E(D(A)) ≅ A and D(E(X)) ≅ X via the natural evaluation embeddings

Natural duality for partial algebras

- Davey [2006] extends natural dualities to categories of partial algebras and relational structures
- Davey, Pitkethly and Willard [2012] give the symmetric formulation $f\sim g$
- Two partial algebras P, P on the same finite set P are compatible if SClo(P) = P[◊]
- In that case $\underline{\mathbf{P}}$ is called an alter ego of \mathbf{P}
- **P** is fully dualizable if $E(D(\mathbf{A})) \cong \mathbf{A}$ and $D(E(\mathbf{X})) \cong \mathbf{X}$ via the evaluation embeddings for all $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbf{ISP}^+(\mathbf{P})$ and $\mathbf{X} \in \mathbf{IS}_c\mathbf{P}^+(\mathbf{P})$

Dualizability of 2-element algebras

Theorem

[Clark, Davey 1998] All 2-element (total) algebras are dualizable, except for the 8 that are limits of descending chains



Peter Jipsen — Chapman University — May 19, 2016

An algorithm for computing $SClo(F) = F^{\Diamond\Diamond}$

Let $\mathbf{A} = \langle A, F \rangle$ be a finite partial algebra with F finite

To compute all *n*-ary partial functions in $F^{\Diamond\Diamond}$, compute the *n*-ary partial clone $C = \text{PClo}_n(F) = \text{subalgebra of } (\mathbf{A} \cup \infty)^{A^n}$ generated by $F \cup \{\pi_1, \dots, \pi_n\}$ the *k*-ary projections Next, close under **equalizers of partial functions**, i.e., $f, g \in C$ implies $E(f,g) \in C$ where $E(f,g)(\mathbf{a}) = \begin{cases} f(\mathbf{a}) & \text{if } f(\mathbf{a}) = g(\mathbf{a}) \\ \text{undef.} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ Finally, close under $R(f,g) = f \upharpoonright_g = \text{the restriction of } f$ to the domain of g, for all $f, g \in C$

Theorem

 $SClo_n(F) = \mathbf{R}(\mathbf{E}(PClo_n(F)))$ where $\mathbf{E}(C) = closure$ under E, same for \mathbf{R}

Programs for computing all unary and binary (structural) clones on $\{0,1\}$ in a web browser are at http://mathv.chapman.edu/~jipsen/uajs

Computing structural clones

Note: DPW'12 exclude operations with empty domain

There are 17 unary and 1693 binary structural clones on $\{0,1\}$ compared to 6 unary and 26 binary (total) clones on $\{0,1\}$

Let
$$\mathbf{P}_1 = \langle \{0,1\},+,\mathbf{0} \rangle$$
 where $\begin{array}{c} + 0 \ 1 \\ \hline 0 \ 0 \ 1 \\ 1 \ 1 \ - \end{array}$

 \mathbf{P}_1 is halfway between the 2-element semilattice and the 2-element group

x	у	0	x+y	2 <i>x</i>	2y	2x+y	x+2y	2x+2y	E(x,y)	$ x _{x+y}$	$y _{x+y}$	$0 _{x+y}$	$0 _{E(x,y)}$
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
0	1	0	1	0	_	1	_	—	_	0	1	0	—
1	0	0	1	_	0	_	1	_	_	1	0	0	_
1	1	0	_	-	_	_	_	—	1	_	_	_	0

P_1 is dualizable at the finite level

Theorem

(Joint with M. A. Moshier)
$$\mathbf{P}_1 = \frac{+ \begin{vmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & - \end{vmatrix}$$
 is dualizable at the finite level

Let $\underline{\mathbf{P}}_1 = \langle \{0,1\}, G \rangle$ where $G = \{+,0\}^{\Diamond}$, so $g \in G$ if $g(0,\ldots,0) = 0$ and if $g(x_1,\ldots,x_k), g(y_1,\ldots,y_k)$, and $x_i + y_i$ defined for $i = 1,\ldots,k$ then $g(x_1 + y_1,\ldots,x_k + y_k) = g(x_1,\ldots,x_k) + g(y_1,\ldots,y_k)$ (both defined)

Show for all finite $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbf{ISP}(\mathbf{P}_1)$ we have $E(D(\mathbf{A})) \cong \mathbf{A}$

Problem: Is P_1 dualizable in general?

Subalgebras, products, homomorphisms

- B ⊆ A is a (partial) subalgebra if B is closed under the partial operations of A
- ∏_{i∈I} A_i is the product; operations are defined pointwise; exist iff they exist in all coords
- Note that $\tilde{\mathbf{A}} \times \tilde{\mathbf{B}} \neq \widetilde{\mathbf{A} \times \mathbf{B}}$ (since e.g. $9 \neq 5$)
- $h : \mathbf{A} \to \mathbf{B}$ is a homomorphism if $h(f^{\mathbf{A}}(x_1, \dots, x_n)) = f^{\mathbf{B}}(h(x_1), \dots, h(x_n))$ for all $(x_1, \dots, x_n) \in D_f$
- HSP is defined using these operations
- Not much is known about $HSP(P_1)$

Identities and quasiidentities

The **signature** of a partial algebra is a set F of (partial) **function symbols**, each with an associated finite arity

The interpretation of f in a partial algebra **A** is denoted f^{A}

Terms and formulas are defined as usual

A term $t(a_1,...,a_n)$ is defined iff **all subterms are defined**

An identity $s(x_1,...,x_n) = t(x_1,...,x_n)$ holds in a partial algebra **A** if for all $x_1,...,x_n \in A$ either **both sides are undefined**, or they are **defined and** equal

A quasiidentity $s_1 = t_1 \& \cdots \& s_n = t_n \implies s = t$ holds in **A** if for all assignments that make **the premises defined and equal**, s, t are **defined and equal**

Properties that hold in $ISP(P_1)$

- x + y = y + x (commutative) • (x + y) + z = x + (y + z) (associative) • x + 0 = x (0 is the identity)
- $x + z = y + z \implies x = y$ (cancellative)
- $x + x = x + x \implies x = 0$ (othogonal)
- P_1 is **coherent**, i.e., if x + y, x + z and y + z are defined, so is (x+y)+z

Examples of algebras in $ISP(P_1)$



• Define $x \le y$ if x + z = y for some z (the **natural order**)

• Can you find another (smaller) example? Guess what! $P_1 = P_{1,1}$

$ISP(P_1)$ is not finitely axiomatizable

Theorem

ISP (P_1) is not finitely axiomatizable.

Proof. Consider the following quasiidentities q_n :

$$\&_{i=0}^{n-1}(x_{2i}+x_{2i+1}=x_{2i+2}+x_{2i+3}) \& \&_{i=0}^{n-1}(x_{2i+1}+x_{2i+2}=y_i) \implies x_0=x_2$$

where index addition is modulo 2n.

We also define a partial algebra $Q_n = \{0, a_0, a_1, \dots, a_{2n-1}, b_0, b_1, \dots, b_n\}$

by 0 + x = 0 = x + 0, $a_{2i} + a_{2i+1} = b_n$, and $a_{2i+1} + a_{2i+2} = b_i$ (index addition mod 2n)

with all other sums undefined.

Claim 1. For all n > 1 the formula q_n holds in **ISP** (P_1) but fails in Q_n .

Proof.

Suppose the premises hold in P_1 but $x_0 \neq x_2$. If $x_0 = 0$ then $x_2 = 1$, and since $x_1 + x_2$ is defined, it follows that $x_1 = 0$. However, this contradicts $x_0 + x_1 = x_2 + x_3$. If $x_0 = 1$ then $x_1 = 0$ since $x_0 + x_1$ is defined, and $x_2 = 0$ since we are assuming $x_0 \neq x_2$. Now $x_0 + x_1 = x_2 + x_3$ implies $x_3 = 1$, and since $x_3 + x_4$ is defined, we have $x_4 = 0.$ If n = 2 then $x_4 = x_0$ since indices are calculated modulo 4, but this contradicts $x_0 = 1$. Assume we have shown $x_{2i-1} = 1$ and $x_{2i} = 0$. Then $x_{2i-2} + x_{2i-1} = x_{2i} + x_{2i+1}$ implies $x_{2i+1} = 1$, hence $x_{2i+2} = 0$. By induction we have $x_{2n} = 0$, which again contradicts $x_0 = 1$. To see that q_n fails in Q_n , let $x_i = a_i$.

Claim 2. The ultraproduct $(\prod_{n \in \omega} Q_n) / \mathscr{U}$ is in **ISP**(P_1) for any nonprincipal ultrafilter \mathscr{U} on ω , hence **ISP**(P_1) is not finitely axiomatizable.

Proof.

(outline) In each Q_n , the term $a_i + a_j$ is defined iff $j = i \pm 1 \pmod{2n}$, and the terms $a_{2i} + a_{2i+1}$ are all equal to b_n .

This same structure holds in the ultraproduct, except that the index addition is now done in \mathbb{Z} .

To see that the ultraproduct is in **ISP**(P_1), it suffices to embed this algebra in the powerset algebra $\mathscr{P}(\omega)$ with disjoint union as partial operation and the empty set as identity.

Let $a_0 = 2\omega$ (= even numbers) and $a_1 = \omega - a_0$. In general, let $a_k = 2k\omega$ and $a_{k+1} = \omega - a_k$, and check that this map is an embedding.

$ISP(P_1)$ is not closed under H



Algebras in $ISP(P_1)$ satisfy no congruence equations

• Consider the partial algebra
$$P_{1,n} = {\begin{array}{ccccc} + & 0 & 1 & \cdots & n \\ \hline 0 & 0 & 1 & \cdots & n \\ 1 & 1 & - & \cdots & - \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & & \vdots \\ n & n & - & \cdots & - \end{array}}$$

- Can identify any two non-zero elements without collapsing any others
- Can identify any non-zero element with 0 without collapsing any others
- Therefore Con(P_{1,n}) = Eq(n) = the lattice of equivalence relations on an n element set
- Any lattice equation fails in Eq(n) for some n